

Tourism Sector Assessors' Characteristics and Employers' Satisfaction on the Graduate's Level Performance

Emilie Suarez-Estelloso

Abstract—This study aimed to find out the characteristics of TESDA assessors as predictors of student's competencies in Tourism Sector. It also determined the influence of the assessor's profile and competencies; assessors and students assessment experiences; and employers' level of satisfaction of graduates' work performance. The findings of this study would lead the researcher to determine the model assessor's characteristics in tourism sector. The study was conducted at University of Southern Mindanao-Kidapawan City Campus (USM-KCC) where the assessors are affiliated and different establishments which the Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) graduates are employed. This study used the descriptive-evaluated design both utilizing the quantitative and qualitative data. Through the help of the survey questionnaire and question guide, the findings revealed that the assessors' profile had high correlation towards the employers' satisfaction on graduate's work performance. Furthermore, the competencies of assessors have substantial or marked relationship to the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' work performance. The null hypotheses were rejected at 0.05% level of significance. There were ten (10) themes formulated for Tourism Sector Assessors' characteristics which will be a guideline in predicting the students' competencies and graduates' work performance.

Index Terms—Assessors, Employer, Graduates, Level of Performance, Satisfaction, Tourism Sector

I. INTRODUCTION

The Technical Education and Skills Development Authority (TESDA) created a program which provides a venue to all technical students and skilled workers to become more competent and to ideally meet the job requirements of the industry. Upon graduating from vocational program and trainings, students may take an examination from TESDA to obtain the relevant certificate or diploma. When the trainee/student is identified as qualified to be awarded with a National Competency, he/she will undergo the assessment according to his/her qualification. The certified TESDA Assessor conducts an assessment and give the recommendation for certificates after the intensive trainings towards the program competencies.

The Philippine government is promoting Tourism and together with that; they open the market for jobs.

Emilie Suarez-Estelloso, Department Head of Technology Education Department Philippines

As the demand for skilled worker arises, the needs for competent and qualified workers also increase. Most of the industries where the students conducted their on-the-job training, recommend the students for a job. Sometimes the establishments immediately hire and absorb the trainees.

With the good impression made by the establishments, the school has to ensure that quality training is conducted for every competency. Based on the On-the-job training (OJT) Supervised Industrial Training Feedback results, there are employers who are dissatisfied with the trainees' level of competencies and behavior. Hence, the school should address the issue.

Manila Bulletin (July 22, 2012) reported that the companies polled also said that the TVET graduates have the theoretical and practical knowledge in accomplishing their work; they were also highly trainable for the skills required for the job, and have a positive work attitude. But the employers suggested that the quality of graduates of Technical Vocational and Education Training (TVET) could still be improved to meet the demand for more in-depth training and exposure on preferred course. While there are more private and public TESDA schools opened aiming to produce competent graduates and the employers now have overwhelming choice of manpower, there are still evidences of low levels of performances among graduates even if they possess the National Certificates.

During the conduct of Assessment Moderation Seminar in 2012, it was mentioned that the granting of competency certificates to incompetent graduates were done due to the mass production of skilled workers and inconsistent assessments procedures. At the start, the TESDA program is upright but later on it weakens due to have poor quality skilled workers produced; too many were awarded with a National Competency Certificates even if they had poor training.

The Provincial TESDA representative also cited that there is now an easy access to obtaining certificates. The objectives of the program are deviated and abuse. The vision of TESDA is aligned with competence, institutional integrity, personal commitment and deep sense of nationalism. The demand for stricter qualifications of the Tech-Voc graduates, trainers and assessors should be given attention. Qualifications which include the educational qualification, competencies, and values should be thoroughly checked.

On these premises and with problems being determined, the researcher is encouraged to determine the characteristics of Tourism sector assessor and the employer's satisfaction

on graduates' work performance in order to produce competent and qualified graduates.

Statement of the Problem

The study aimed to find out the characteristics of Tourism Sector assessors and employers' satisfaction on graduate work performance. Specifically, it answered the following questions:

1. What is the characteristic of the tourism sector assessors in terms of:
 - 1.1. profile
 - 1.2. competencies
2. What is the level of employers' satisfaction on Tourism Sector graduates' work performance?
3. What is the relationship between the:
 - 3.1. Assessors' profile and the level of satisfaction of the employers; and
 - 3.2. Assessors' competencies and the level of satisfaction of the employers
4. What are the experiences of the assessors and students during assessment?
5. Based on the findings, what are the characteristics of a Tourism Sector Assessor?

Null Hypotheses

- Ho 1: There is no significant relationship between assessors' profile and the level of employer's satisfaction.
- Ho 2: There is no significant relationship between the assessors' competencies and the level of employer's satisfaction.

II. METHODOLOGY

Research Design

This study used descriptive and correlational design which deals with the relationship between variables and describes the degree to which two or more quantitative variables are related. Data were gathered with the use of structured survey questionnaire, interview guide, and documentary analysis which were the main instruments for gathering data.

Research Locale

This study was conducted in Kidapawan City. The researcher gathered the Tourism Sector assessors' profile and competency at the University of Southern Mindanao Kidapawan City Campus, College of Industry and Technology (USM-KCC, CIT), Sudapin Kidapawan City. It is the State University and College (SUC) in North Cotabato that offers Technical Vocational Program. It was the former North Cotabato College of Arts and Technology (NCCAT) which is recipient of the Australian aid particularly in Technical-Vocational Training and Skills Development. The said school was identified as assessment center since 1983. It provides the different areas of qualifications in trade and includes the Tourism Sector like Food and Beverage Services; Baking and Pastry Production; Bartending; Commercial Cooking; Housekeeping Services; and Food Processing.

Respondents of the Study

The researcher gathered data from the identified Tourism Sector assessors of University of Southern Mindanao, Kidapawan City Campus, College of Industry and Technology; TVET students; and employers of different establishment who had hired TVET graduates.

Sampling Procedure

This study used multi-stage sampling procedure. The first stage was complete enumeration or purposive sampling of the identified assessors in Tourism Sector. Likewise, the employers were purposively selected from the establishments which have TVET graduates employee. The second stage, the TVET students under Tourism Sector were selected through random sampling. The researcher got the 55% out of the total students' population.

Research Instrument

The research instruments utilized to gather the needed information were as follows:

Survey Instrument. There were three kinds of survey questionnaire to gather the different data.

a.1 For assessor' profile. The respondents checked and filled up the data needed by the researcher. It was composed of four (4) indicators such as educational requirement; level of National Competencies (NC); skills expertise; and National certifications.

a.2 For assessor' competency. The researcher distributed a survey questionnaire to measure the extent of the implementation of assessors' competencies in areas of qualification and Competency Based Curriculum. The questionnaire had two phases, where the assessor did self-evaluation and students also evaluated the assessors' competency. In this way, the researcher validated the answers. Moreover, the questionnaire underwent the test-retest method before it was given to the assessors and students for evaluation. The survey questionnaire used the five-point scale with "1" as the lowest and "5" as the highest rating. The researcher conducted a pre-survey to the ten (10) assessors and 10 students of other technical schools twice using the same instrument.

a.3 For Employers' level of satisfaction. The identified employers will rate the work performance of their employees who are TVET/TESDA graduates. The survey questionnaire will be using five rating scale. The questionnaire was validated by five (5) experts of the academe.

Documentary Analysis Checklist. This was used to analyze the Tourism sector assessor' records considering their profile and competencies. The researcher will ask permission from the office of the Dean to allow her to examine the documents.

Interview Guide. The researcher will conduct interview to the two (2) sets of respondents: the assessor and students. The interview guide contains the topic about assessment and their experiences during assessment. The interview guides were validated by five (5) experts.

Rating Scale

To quantify the variables based on the standard set by TESDA, the rating shown in Box 1 was adapted. This shows the rating scale for assessors' profile. The arbitrary ratings were the profile requirement of the assessor which includes

the educational requirement, level of national certificate, skills and expertise, and national certifications. The criteria were based on the Procedures Quality Manual: Book II, series of 2012. The highest rating of five (5) indicates that the assessor had reached more than the set standard and the lowest rating of 1 had the least qualification.

Box 1. Rating the Assessors' Profile

Rating	Mean Range	Verbal Description	Criteria
5	4.3 to 5.0	Very Much Qualified	Doctorate candidate to full pledge doctor 6 and above National certificate 16 and above identified skills 5 and above NC II, Assessor's and Trainer's Training Methodology, LET, & Civil Service Eligibility
4	3.5 to 4.2	Highly Qualified	Master candidate to full pledge masters 4 to 5 National Certificate 11 to 15 identified skills More than 2 NC II, Assessor's and Trainer's Training Methodology, & LET
3	2.4 to 3.0	Qualified	BS Degree or Equivalent 2 to 3 National Certificate 6 to 10 identified skills NC II, Assessor's and Trainer's Training Methodology
2	1.7 to 2.3	Less Qualified	College Level with NC II 1 National Certificate 3 to 5 identified skills NC II, and Trainer's Training Methodology only
1	1.0 to 1.6	Least Qualified	High school Graduate with NC II Certificate of Competency (COC) only 2 identified skills NC II only

Box 2 shows the rating scale for assessors' competency. The competencies were based on the Training Regulation of different area of qualification in Tourism Sector. The scale competencies were rated by the assessors themselves and by student evaluations. They determined the competencies as what they had practiced and observed. It had rating scale, with "5" as the highest and "1" as the lowest.

Box 2. Rating the Assessors' Competency

Rating	Mean Range	Verbal Description	Interpretation
5	4.3 to 5.0	Very Much Competent	The assessor very much conforms to the standard policy he/she does it very highly efficient within 80-100% of the time.
4	3.5 to 4.2	Highly Competent	The assessor highly conforms to the standard policy and he/she does it highly efficient within 60-79% of the time.
3	2.4 to 3.0	Competent	The assessor averagely conforms to the standard policy and he/she does it highly efficient within 40-59% of the time.
2	1.7 to 2.3	Not So Competent	The assessor slightly conforms to the standard policy and he/she does it highly efficient within 20-39% of the time.
1	1.0 to 1.6	Not Competent	The assessor is not conforms to the standard policy and he/she does it highly efficient within 1-19% of the time.

Box 3. Rating the Employers' Level of Satisfaction as indicated by Work Performance of Graduates

Rating	Mean Range	Verbal Description	Interpretation
5	4.3 to 5.0	Very much Satisfied	The employer is very highly contented to the performance of the employee who follows the training regulations within 80-100% of the time.
4	3.5 to 4.2	Very Satisfied	The employer is highly contented to the performance of the employee who follows the training regulations within 60-79% of the time.
3	2.7 to 3.4	Satisfied	The employer is averagely contented to the performance of the employee who follows the training regulations within 40-59% of the time.
2	1.9 to 2.6	Fairy Satisfied	The employer is slightly contented to the performance of the employee who follows the training regulations within 20-39% of the time.
1	1.0 to 1.8	Not Satisfied	The employer is not contented to the performance of the employee who follows the training regulations within 1-19% of the time.

Box 3 presents the rating scale for employers' level of satisfaction as indicated by work performance of graduates on page 72. The scale was based on the values and specific competencies in different areas of qualification in Tourism Sector. The employer rated their employees (TEVET Graduates) on their actual working performance.

Limitations and Assumption of the Study

The influence of assessor's characteristics to the work performance is not directly studied in this paper. However,

the performance is assumed to be good if the employers are satisfied.

Statistical Analysis

The data gathered was analyzed using descriptive statistics, weighted means and frequency counts. The correlation between assessors' profile and competencies; and employers' satisfaction on the TVET/TESDA graduates' work performance was computed using statistical tool. The hypothesis was tested using Pearson r Momentum Correlation at 0.05% level of significance. Furthermore, the characteristics of Tourism Sector assessor were identified based on the findings of this study.

III. PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF DATA

Profile of Assessors

Table 1 shows the profile of Tourism Sector assessors in terms of educational requirement. The University of Southern Mindanao - Kidapawan City Campus (USM-KCC) have six (6) registered Tourism Sector assessors. The data revealed that the assessor 1, 2, and 3 are rated as very much qualified with a mean of 5.0. Moreover, the assessor 3, 4, and 6 are rated as highly qualified with the mean of 4.0. The Procedures Quality Manual: Book II, series of 2012, stated the minimum requirement to qualify as the TESDA assessor is BS graduate or its equivalent. There are four (4) faculty who took the graduate programs related to technology while two (2) are specialized in other disciplines. However, these two faculty have their baccalaureate degrees inclined to food and technology. Further, the total mean of the six (6) assessors were 4.50 which is also rated as very much qualified.

Table 1. Profile of Tourism Sector Assessors in terms of Educational Requirement
Standard: BS Graduate or equivalent

Assessor	Highest Educational Background	Rating	Remarks/ Interpretation
1	Doctorate Degree – Academic Equivalent Course: Doctor of Technology Education	5.0	Very Much Qualified
2	Doctorate Degree – Academic Equivalent Course: Doctor of Technology Education	5.0	Very Much Qualified
3	Masteral Degree – 36 units Course: Master of Vocational Education	4.0	Highly Qualified

4	Masteral Degree – Academic Equivalent Course: Master of Arts Teaching Industrial Arts	4.0	Highly Qualified
5	Doctorate Degree – full pledge/graduate Course: Doctor of Education Major: Educational Management Minor: Extension and Rural Development	5.0	Very Much Qualified
6	Masteral Degree – full pledge/graduate Course: Master of Arts in English Vocational: Food Preparation and Service Technology	4.0	Highly Qualified
Mean		4.50	Very Much Qualified

Level of National Certificate

Table 2 shows the assessor's level of national certificate. Accreditation for assessor required the aspiring assessor to acquire the level 2 in every qualification. The Tourism Sector has nine (9) qualifications but only four of the qualifications are acquired by the faculty of USM-KCC and one qualification is under Agriculture Sector. Based on the criteria made, a faculty who has all the nine (9) qualifications is reported as very much qualified.

Table 2. Assessors' Level of National Certificate
Standard: 1-3 National Certificate (NC) holders

Assessor	Area of Qualification and Level of Certificate	Rating	Remarks/ Interpretation
1	Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Food Processing NC II	4.0	Highly Qualified
2	Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II	4.0	Highly Qualified

	Bread and Pastry Production NC II Food Processing NC II		
3	Food and Beverage Services NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II	3.0	Qualified
4	Food and Beverage Services NC II Certificate of Competency in FBS NC III	3.0	Qualified
5	Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II	4.0	Highly Qualified
6	Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II	3.0	Qualified
Mean		3.50	Highly Qualified

The data presented in the table 2 revealed that the assessors 1, 2, and 5 obtained more than four (4) qualifications and are rated highly qualified with a mean of 4.0. Meanwhile, the assessors 3, 4, and 6 obtained the qualified rating only. However, the overall ratings of the six (6) assessors are still highly qualified with the mean of 3.50. Thus, the adage of said department is to have quality service in Food and Beverage section. Each of the faculty had more than 2 areas of qualification as trainer and assessor.

Skills and Expertise

Table 3 presents the Tourism Sector assessors’ skills and expertise. The competencies presented in the table were taken into the different core competencies of Tourism Sector qualification such as Food and Beverage Services, Bartending, Commercial Cooking, Bread and Pastry Production, Housekeeping Services, and Food Processing.

The assessors 1, 3, and 4 have been serving the institution for more than 25 years. Whereas, the assessors 2, 5, and 6 have reached 5 years above in service. Two of the assessors had experienced working in the industry before teaching. Further, the four of the assessors are involved in restaurant and bakeshop business. The skills of the assessors were enhanced and developed through their daily experiences in life. Thus, it makes the assessors becomes experts in their field.

Table 3 reveals that in terms of skills and expertise, the entire faculty was skillful in preparing, cooking, and serving food for menu. There are ten (10) identified skills which are confirmed to be possessed by six assessors. The assessors 1, 3, and 4 are rated as very much qualified because in each skill presented, they possessed 16 and above number of competencies. However, assessors 2 and 6 only possess 6 to 10 identified skills for which they are rated as qualified. One assessor was rated as less qualified because she possessed only 3 to 5 identified skills. While the result showed an extreme difference among the skills and expertise acquired

by the assessors, they are still rated as highly qualified as a whole with the mean of 3.83. The data shows that each assessor had different skills and expertise, which are channeled the needs of the trainees/students.

Table 3. Assessors’ Skills and Expertise

Standard: 6-10 competencies in the qualifications with experience

Assessor	Total Competence	Rating	Remarks/Interpretation
1	17	5.0	Very Much Qualified
2	9	3.0	Qualified
3	16	5.0	Very Much Qualified
4	16	5.0	Very Much Qualified
5	3	2.0	Less Qualified
6	7	3.0	Qualified
Mean		3.83	Highly Qualified

National Certification

Table 4 shows the license, eligibility, and certification of assessors as basis for national certification. In terms of assessor’s eligibility, the data found in table 4 revealed that the six (6) assessors reached more than the minimum requirements which includes licensure Exam for Teacher (LET) and Civil Service Eligibility. The results mean that the assessors are very much qualified to the requirements needed with the mean of 4.33. It also implied that the USM-KCC faculty could also teach and qualified to the higher education seems they had LET and CS eligibility.

Table 4. License/Eligibility/Certifications of the Assessor

Standard: National Certificate NC II holder, Trainer’s Methodology Training (TM 1), Assessor’s Methodology Training (AM 1), Two (2) years and above working experience

Assessor	License/Eligibility/Certifications	Total	Rating	Remarks/Interpretation
1	Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Housekeeping Services NC II Food Processing TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers Certificate of Accredited Assessors	10	5.0	Very Much Qualified

Tourism Sector Assessors' Characteristics and Employers' Satisfaction on the Graduate's Level Performance

2	Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Housekeeping Services NC II Food Processing TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers Certificate of Accredited Assessors	10	5.0	Very Much Qualified
3	Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Housekeeping Services TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers Certificate of Accredited Assessors	9	4.0	Highly Qualified
4	Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Housekeeping Services TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers Certificate of Accredited Assessors	9	4.0	Highly Qualified
5	Civil Service Eligibility Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Commercial Cooking NC II Bread and Pastry Production NC II Housekeeping Services NC II Food Processing TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers	11	5.0	Very Much Qualified

	Certificate of Accredited Assessors			
6	Licensure Exam for Teacher NC II Food and Beverage Services NC II Bartending NC II Housekeeping Services TVET Certificates Certificate of Qualified Trainers Certificate of Accredited Assessors	7	3.0	Qualified
Total Mean			4.33	Very Much Qualified

Competencies of Assessor in the Implementation of Areas of Qualification assessment

Based on the results, both assessors and students obtained the mean of 4.86 which rated the indicators as very much competent. These indicators measure the extent of activities achieved by the assessors. Even that the weighted mean of assessors' and students' rating have difference but still they belong in the same nominal range which indicates that they had more or less similar in their observation. Thus, they really followed the procedure logically with implicit working performance. The student builds a good relationship with the assessor during assessment.

Table 5. Evaluation on the Assessors' Competency in Areas of Qualification

The assessor....	Rating		—x	Interpretation
	Self	Student		
1.explains the competencies of their chosen qualification before they start the training.	5.0	4.11	4.56	Very Much Competent
2.cooperates with TESDA representatives while conducting compliance audit.	5.0	4.30	4.65	Very Much Competent
3.presents a progressive chart and display it in public so that the trainees are aware with their performance.	4.8 6	4.28	4.57	Very Much Competent
4. follows the procedure of the evidence plan.	5.0	4.62	4.81	Very Much Competent
5. conducts the assessment that governed and guided by the rules and regulations based on the PTQCS Guidelines and Procedures Manual	4.8 6	4.77	4.82	Very Much Competent

on Competency Assessment.				
6. shows the rating scale and results of assessment to the candidates/students.	4.86	4.85	4.86	Very Much Competent
Mean	4.86			Very Much Competent

Table 6 shows the assessors' competency in commercial cooking qualification.

The table 6 presented the specific competency of the assessor in their area of qualification as rated by students and assessors. In Commercial Cooking qualification, the self-rating of the assessors revealed that the assessors possess the said competencies consistently. It was found out that there were only 17 competencies which were comparable to the rating of assessor and students. These competencies were visibly noticed by the students during the assessment. Meanwhile, there were 20 competencies which unfortunately the assessors do not perform well as rated by the assessors and students. There are competencies in the students rating that shows lower weighted mean compared to the assessors rating but this competency does not affect much to the total rating of two parties which rated it as very much competent with the mean of 4.87.

Table 6. Assessors' Competency in Commercial Cooking Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	x	
1. clean kitchen premises.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent
2. maintain kitchen premises.	5.0	4.57	4.79	Very Much Competent
3. organize food.	5.0	4.71	4.86	Very Much Competent
4. prepare food.	5.0	4.71	4.86	Very Much Competent
5. select meat.	5.0	4.29	4.65	Very Much Competent
6. prepare meat.	5.0	4.29	4.65	Very Much Competent
7. cook meat.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent
8. receive kitchen supplies.	5.0	4.29	4.65	Very Much Competent
9. store kitchen supplies.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent
10. prepare stocks.	5.0	4.57	4.79	Very Much Competent
11. prepare sauces.	5.0	4.57	4.79	Very Much Competent

12. prepare soups.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent
13. prepare food for the menu.	5.0	4.86	4.93	Very Much Competent
14. cook food for menu.	5.0	4.71	4.86	Very Much Competent
15. serve food for menu.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent
16. prepare hot appetizers.	5.0	3.71	4.36	Very Much Competent
17. prepare cold appetizers.	5.0	4.57	4.79	Very Much Competent
18. prepare hot salads.	5.0	3.86	4.43	Very Much Competent
19. prepare cold salads.	5.0	4.29	4.65	Very Much Competent
20. prepare hot sandwiches.	5.0	3.86	4.43	Very Much Competent
21. prepare cold sandwiches.	5.0	3.57	4.29	Highly Competent
22. prepare vegetables dishes.	4.75	4.29	4.52	Very Much Competent
23. prepare fruits dishes.	4.75	3.86	4.31	Very Much Competent
24. prepare eggs dishes.	4.75	3.57	4.16	Highly Competent
25. prepare starch dishes.	5.0	4.0	4.50	Very Much Competent
26. prepare poultry and game.	5.0	4.0	4.50	Very Much Competent
27. cook poultry and game.	5.0	4.14	4.57	Very Much Competent
28. prepare portion controlled meat cuts.	5.0	4.14	4.57	Very Much Competent
29. prepare seafood.	5.0	3.57	4.29	Highly Competent
30. cook seafood.	5.0	4.29	4.75	Very Much Competent
31. prepare hot desserts.	5.0	3.86	4.43	Very Much Competent
32. prepare cold desserts.	5.0	3.86	4.43	Very Much Competent
33. prepare pastry.	5.0	4.43	4.72	Very Much Competent

Tourism Sector Assessors' Characteristics and Employers' Satisfaction on the Graduate's Level Performance

34.prepare cakes.	5.0	4.57	4.79	Very Much Competent
35.prepare yeast-based products.	5.0	4.71	4.86	Very Much Competent
36. present food.	5.0	4.71	4.86	Very Much Competent
37. package prepared foodstuffs.	4.75	4.57	4.66	Very Much Competent
Mean			4.87	Very Much Competent

Table 7 shows the assessors' competency in Food and Beverage qualification.

Table 7 reveals that the students agreed to the competencies are apparently visible to everyone. The competencies of this qualification were almost reached the highest rating which represented with the total mean of 4.96 or very much competent. It was also found out that assessors performed the competencies excellently. The data implied that the assessors of the said institution are trained well in Food and Beverage qualification and considered as center of excellence in this qualification. Furthermore, the Food Science and Technology department envision to produce a graduate who is globally competitive in Food and Beverage Preparation and Services. The program offered in the said department focused on the competencies under Food and Beverage department in hospitality industry.

Table 7. Assessors' Competency in Food and Beverage Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	\bar{x}	
provide a link between kitchen an service area.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
provide food services.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
provide beverage services.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
provide room service.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
develop food and beverage knowledge.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
update food and beverage knowledge.	5.0	5.0	5.0	
Mean			4.96	Very Much Competent

Table 8 data revealed that there are two competencies which got a weighted mean of 4.75 and 4.50 respectively and the rest of the competencies got 5.0 rating. As stated in the core competency in Food and Beverage Service, the "provide wine service" competency is also included. With this regard, assessors do not give much attention with this competency under bartending qualification because they had undergone this in FBS qualification. However, the

computation differs only few points which the total mean of the assessors and students rating are still very much competent with the mean of 4.89.

Table 8. Assessors' Competency in Bartending Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	\bar{x}	
clean bar areas.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
operate bars.	5.0	4.50	4.75	Very Much Competent
prepare cocktails drinks.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
mix cocktail drinks.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
prepare non-alcoholic drinks.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
mix non-alcoholic drinks.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
provide wine service.	5.0	4.0	4.50	Very Much Competent
Mean			4.89	Very Much Competent

Table 9 shows the rating of assessors and students on the Bread and Pastry Production qualification which revealed that from 11 competencies based on the students rating, there were four competencies performed as mandated by the policy. Table 8 data revealed that there are two competencies which got a weighted mean of 4.75 and 4.50 respectively and the rest of the competencies got 5.0 rating. As stated in the core competency in Food and Beverage Service, the "provide wine service" competency is also included. With this regard, assessors do not give much attention with this competency under bartending qualification because they had undergone this in FBS qualification. However, the computation differs only few points which the total mean of the assessors and students rating are still very much competent with the mean of 4.89.

Table 9. Assessors' Competency in Bread and Pastry Production Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	\bar{x}	
prepare pastry products for patisseries.	5.0	4.47	4.74	Very Much Competent
Prepare baker products for patisseries.	5.0	4.47	4.74	Very Much Competent

prepare gateaux.	5.0	3.87	4.44	Very Much Competent
present gateaux.	5.0	3.73	4.37	Very Much Competent
prepare tortes.	5.0	4.0	4.50	Very Much Competent
present tortes.	5.0	3.93	4.47	Very Much Competent
prepare cakes.	5.0	4.80	4.90	Very Much Competent
present cakes.	5.0	4.93	4.97	Very Much Competent
present desserts.	5.0	4.53	4.77	Very Much Competent
10. prepare petits fours.	5.0	4.0	4.50	Very Much Competent
11. display petits fours.	5.0	3.93	4.47	Very Much Competent
Mean			4.62	Very Much Competent

However, the terms used in the list of competencies were not common to some of the assessor for example the “gateaux” which means rich cake, typically one containing layers of cream or fruit. But the students successfully baked chocolate moist cake. Reservations should also be considered as the students’ answers are quite unreliable because of misinterpretation of the word. The result revealed that the ratings of both parties are still described by themselves as very much competent with a mean of 4.62.

Table 10 revealed that the students rated the assessors to do the competencies of Housekeeping Services as very much competent with the mean of 4.87. Nevertheless, the “laundry guest cloths” was not rated as competent because most of the laundry services that the students and assessors encountered were table cloth, linens for skirting, chair cover and the like. Moreover, the principles applying to these competencies were the same but it was found out that they oftentimes performed the job.

Table 10. Assessors’ Competency in Housekeeping Services Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	—x	
provide housekeeping services to guests.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
prepare rooms for guests.	5.0	4.88	4.94	Very Much Competent
provide valet/butler service.	5.0	4.75	4.88	Very Much Competent
laundry linen.	5.0	4.63	4.82	Very Much Competent
laundry guest clothes.	5.0	4.25	4.63	Very Much Competent
clean premises.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
Mean			4.87	Very Much Competent

Table 11 reveals that the students confirmed the capability and competence of the assessors to perform the job. Nevertheless, the “processing food by pickling” had a lower mean among the others. Yet, despite of the lower mean, the faculty of the FST department had an extension program and one of the products that they are producing were at chara, sayote pickle-relish, and sayote catsup. The result implied that the assessors are also described as very much competent with the mean of 4.84 and unconsciously performing the competencies explicitly.

Table 11. Assessors’ Competency in Food Processing Qualification

I can...	Rating			Verbal Description
	Self	Student	—x	
process foods by salting.	5.0	4.67	4.84	Very Much Competent
process food by curing.	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
process food by smoking.	5.0	4.67	4.84	Very Much Competent
process foods by sugar concentration.	5.0	4.67	4.84	Very Much Competent
process food by fermentation	5.0	5.0	5.0	Very Much Competent
Process food by pickling.	5.0	4.33	4.67	Very Much Competent
package finished/processed food products.	4.75	4.67	4.71	Very Much Competent
Total Mean			4.84	Very Much Competent

Table 12 presents the six (6) qualifications performed by the assessors impressively and logically. It also shows that Food and Beverages Services qualification is exceptionally executed. Therefore, it was agreed that the USM-KCC is considered as one of the assessment center of these qualifications and there are recognized Excellence of Skills Provider. All of the Programs offered in this institution had long hours scheduled laboratory a day in order to make the trainees or students well versed in their field and skills. The data shows that the assessors of this institution are very much competent in his/her discipline with the mean of 4.84.

Table 12. Summary of Assessors’ Competency

Competency	Rating (x)	Verbal Description	Interpretation
Commercial Cooking	4.87	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently
Food and Beverage Services	4.96	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently

Bartending	4.89	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently
Bread and Pastry Production	4.62	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently
Housekeeping Services	4.87	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently
Food Processing	4.84	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently
Mean	4.84	Very Much Competent	The assessors truly conform and most of the time he/she do it efficiently

8. receiving kitchen supplies.	3.40	Satisfied
9. storing kitchen supplies.	3.36	Satisfied
10. preparing stocks.	3.28	Satisfied
11. preparing sauces.	3.32	Satisfied
12. preparing soup.	3.24	Satisfied
13. preparing food for menu.	3.40	Satisfied
14. cooking food for menu.	3.56	Very Satisfied
15. serving food for menu.	3.52	Very Satisfied
16. preparing hot appetizers.	3.36	Satisfied
17. preparing hot salads.	3.24	Satisfied
18. preparing cold appetizers.	3.24	Satisfied
19. preparing cold salads.	3.32	Satisfied
20. preparing hot sandwiches.	3.08	Satisfied
21. preparing cold sandwiches.	2.88	Satisfied
22. preparing vegetables dishes.	3.36	Satisfied
23. preparing fruits dishes.	3.40	Satisfied
24. preparing eggs dishes	3.24	Satisfied
25. preparing starch dishes	3.40	Satisfied
26. preparing poultry and game.	3.64	Very Satisfied
27. cooking poultry and game.	3.52	Very Satisfied
28. preparing portion controlled meat cuts.	3.36	Satisfied
29. preparing seafood.	3.32	Satisfied
30. cooking seafood.	3.32	Satisfied
31. preparing hot desserts.	3.16	Satisfied
32. preparing cold desserts.	3.28	Satisfied
33. preparing pastry.	3.28	Satisfied
34. preparing cakes.	3.36	Satisfied
35. preparing yeast-based products.	3.20	Satisfied
36. presenting food.	3.56	Satisfied
37. packaging prepared foodstuffs.	3.48	Satisfied
Total Mean	3.40	Satisfied

Employers' Satisfaction on TESDA Graduates' Work Performance

The table 13 shows the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' work performance in Commercial Cooking qualification. The competencies presented in the table were taken from the core competencies of said qualification. It is patterned from the Training Regulation of Commercial Cooking NC II qualification.

The data presented in table 13 revealed that there are ten (10) competencies rated by the employer as very satisfactory and twenty-seven (27) competencies are satisfactory only.

The data revealed that the employers are comfortable and sometimes very satisfied with the work performance of the employees of the Commis, Pastry Cook, Hot-Kitchen Cook, and Pantry worker or Cold Kitchen Cook. It was revealed that the TVET graduates under this program are competent in terms of Hot Kitchen Cook but they are average in performance in Cold Kitchen Cook. The result is not strongly represents the competencies from Commercial Cooking qualification because the establishments where the researcher obtained the data did not specialize in Cold Kitchen Cook dishes. The overall competencies under this qualification are rated by the employer as satisfied at a rating of 3.40.

Table 13. Employers' Satisfaction on TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance In Commercial Cooking

The TVET graduate's competency in...	\bar{x}	Verbal Description
1. cleaning kitchen premises.	3.96	Very Satisfied
2. maintaining kitchen premises.	3.48	Satisfied
3. organizing and preparing food.	3.64	Very Satisfied
4. preparing food.	3.68	Very Satisfied
5. selecting meat.	3.56	Very Satisfied
6. preparing meat.	3.60	Very Satisfied
7. cooking meat.	3.64	Very Satisfied

The self-evaluation of assessors of their working values showed that only the attribute of "presenting oneself as a source of inspiration" was rated as not so competent. The assessors evaluated themselves as unsure and do not oftentimes perform this kind of behavior because they don't have much interaction with the students. Most of the assessors had 2 or more area of qualification which led them to have the hectic schedules and they don't have time to mingle with the students for long. Nevertheless, the rest of

the values were rated by the assessor as competent for they truly conform that they possessed the values presented.

Table 14 shows the employers' satisfaction on the TVET/TESDA graduates' work performance in Food and Beverage Services qualification. The competencies presented in the table were taken from the Training Regulation of Food and Beverage Services NC II qualification.

The data from table 14 revealed that the employers are very satisfied of the TVET workers as Busboy, Waiter, Food Attendant, and Food Server with the weighted mean of 3.74, 3.81, 3.67, 3.56, and 3.52 respectively. These show that from 6 competencies, five (5) competencies are performed well and the employers rely on them. Most of the TVET graduates evaluated are working on the dining areas. The employers are very satisfied with the performance of the TVET graduates and they trust their employees to face the costumer and perform the policy standards.

Table 14. Employers' Satisfaction on TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance in Food and Beverage Services

The TVET graduate's competency in...	\bar{x}	Verbal Description
1. providing a link between kitchen and service area.	3.74	Very Satisfied
2. providing food services.	3.81	Very Satisfied
3. providing beverage services.	3.67	Very Satisfied
4. providing room service.	3.37	Satisfied
5. developing food and beverage knowledge.	3.56	Very Satisfied
6. updating food and beverage knowledge.	3.52	Very Satisfied
Total Mean	3.61	Very Satisfied

Table 15 shows the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' performance in Bartending qualification. The competencies presented were taken from the Training Regulation of Bartending NC II qualification. Furthermore, the TVET employees as Bar boy, Bartender/Barista, Wine Steward, and Bar porter performed their job very satisfactory. In particularly the work includes cleaning bar areas and operating the bar with the weighted mean of 4.0 and 3.63 respectively. These data are shown at table 15. The result shows that the graduates are meticulous in sanitation, hygiene, and other competencies and their performance were rated as very satisfactory. It showed that the TVET graduates could also perform averagely in Bartending qualification in which the employers are satisfied on the performance showed by the TVET graduates as their employees.

Consequently, the bartender is the top position among the staff of the front of house. Depending on the style and set up of a restaurant, a bartender may be responsible for getting the rest of the staff drinks for their tables (service bar) as well as taking care of customers who sit at the bar.

Table 15. Employers' Satisfaction on TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance in Bartending

The TVET graduate's competency in...	\bar{x}	Verbal Description
1. cleaning bar areas.	4.0	Very Satisfied
2. operating bars.	3.83	Very Satisfied
3. preparing cocktail drinks.	3.17	Satisfied
4. mixing cocktail drinks.	3.17	Satisfied
5. preparing non-alcoholic drinks.	3.17	Satisfied
6. mixing non-alcoholic drinks.	3.17	Satisfied
7. providing wine service.	3.33	Satisfied
Total Mean	3.41	Satisfied

Table 16 shows that TVET graduates are rated very satisfactory in their job and in becoming Commis 1, 2 or 3, in doing Pastry and Baker, in preparing pastry production for patisseries; in preparing bake products for patisseries; in preparing gateaux, and in preparing cakes. They also perform the other competencies rated as satisfactory by their employers. Providing high quality bakery products is a driving force of the Baker Boy. Our full line of high-quality, great tasting bakery products are crafted by real hands with real heart to help us build customer satisfaction and drive sales (Baker Boy Shop, Inc.,2013).

Table 16. Employers' Satisfaction of TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance in Bread and Pastry Production

The TVET graduate's competency in...	\bar{x}	Verbal Description
1. preparing pastry products for patisseries.	3.56	Very Satisfied
2. preparing baker products for patisseries.	3.67	Very Satisfied
3. preparing gateaux.	3.56	Very Satisfied
4. preparing tortes.	3.44	Satisfied
5. preparing cakes.	3.67	Very Satisfied
6. presenting gateaux.	3.33	Satisfied
7. presenting tortes.	3.44	Satisfied
8. presenting cakes.	3.44	Satisfied
9. presenting desserts.	3.44	Satisfied
10. preparing petits fours.	3.33	Satisfied
11. displaying petits fours.	3.44	Satisfied
Total Mean	3.48	Satisfied

Table 17 shows the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' performance in Housekeeping Services.

The data on Table 17 show that the TVET/TESDA graduates performed their task under Housekeeping Services

Tourism Sector Assessors' Characteristics and Employers' Satisfaction on the Graduate's Level Performance

with rating of satisfactory and a mean of 3.24. While the graduates do not have course in housekeeping, they had the basic knowledge and skills in this qualification. The competencies under this qualification were acquired during their on-the-job-training while they were still studying. Hence, the employers did not find difficulty to instruct and give the task to them.

Table 17. Employers' Satisfaction on TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance in Housekeeping Services

The TVET graduate's competency in...	x	Verbal Description
1. providing housekeeping services to guests.	3.3 3	Satisfied
2. preparing rooms for guests.	3.3 3	Satisfied
3. providing valet/butler service.	3.2 2	Satisfied
4. laundering linens.	3.3 3	Satisfied
5. laundering guest clothes	3.0	Satisfied
6. cleaning premises.	3.2 2	Satisfied
Total Mean	3.2 4	Satisfied

The competencies presented in Table 18 were taken from the Training Regulation of Food Processing NC II qualification.

Table 18 presents the data from the competencies in Housekeeping Services and Food processing which were rated as satisfactory with the mean of 3.0. The employers were satisfied with the graduates' working performance. While the TVET graduates performance was not excellent in their job assignments, they had the skills to develop and enhance. These attributes gave them an aide to other degree program. Their experience teaches and develops them to become an outstanding employee someday (Reynes, J.).

Table 18. Employers' Satisfaction on TVET/TESDA Graduates' Performance in Food Processing

The TVET graduate's competency in...	x	Verbal Description
1. processing foods by salting.	3.0	Satisfied
2. processing foods curing	3.0	Satisfied
3. processing foods by smoking.	3.0	Satisfied
4. processing foods by sugar concentration.	3.0	Satisfied
5. processing food by fermentation.	3.0	Satisfied
6. processing food by pickling.	3.0	Satisfied
7. packaging finished/processed food	3.0	Satisfied

products.		
Total Mean	3.0	Satisfied

Table 19 presents the summary of employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' performance in different area of qualifications of Tourism Sector such as Commercial Cooking, Food and Beverage Services, Bartending, Bread and Pastry Production, Housekeeping Services, and Food Processing.

The level of satisfaction of employers on the different qualification is presented in Table 19. The results revealed that majority of the employers are satisfied on the performance of the TVET graduates. The total mean of rating in all means is 3.36. Meanwhile, the employers rated very satisfied on the Food and Beverage Services. The TVET graduates performed the competencies without the supervision of the manager. The employers affirm that they can trust leaving the work to their employees and return into the working area with confidence because they knew that their employees do their work satisfactorily.

Table 19. Summary of Employers' Satisfaction on TEVET/TESDA Graduates

Competency	Rating (x)	Verbal Description	Interpretation
Commercial Cooking	3.40	Satisfied	The employers meet their projected expectations from their employees; employers are satisfied
Food and Beverage Services	3.61	Very Satisfied	The employers are comfortable on the working performance of their employees; very satisfied
Bartending	3.41	Satisfied	The employers meet their projected expectations from their employees; employers are satisfied
Bread and Pastry Production	3.48	Satisfied	The employer meets their projected expectations from their employees; employers are satisfied
Housekeeping Services	3.24	Satisfied	The employers meet their projected expectations from their employees; employers are satisfied
Food Processing	3.0	Satisfied	The employers meet their projected expectations on their employees; employers are satisfied
Mean	3.36	Satisfied	The employers meet their projected expectations on their employees; employers are satisfied

Assessors Characteristics and the Work Performance of TVET Graduates

Table 20 shows the relationship of assessors' profile on the employers' satisfaction of graduates' level of performance. The researcher determine the contribution of each assessors' profile such as educational requirement, level of national certificate, skills and expertise, and national certifications on the graduates' performance in different areas of qualification in Tourism Sector. It also includes the values and specific competencies of the TVET graduates as they performed the given task. The employer's evaluation will validate the working performance of the employee (TVET/TESDA graduates).

Based on the result shown on the Table 20, the assessors' profile and employers' satisfaction on graduate's level of performance obtained the Pearson r Correlation value of 0.78 which is interpreted as high correlation or very high relationship. The null hypothesis was rejected at 0.05 level of significance. It implied that there is relationship between the assessor's profile such as educational requirement; level of national certificate; skills and expertise; and national certification with the level of satisfaction of employer on the TVET/TESDA graduates' performance in two-tailed test with the probability of 0.0535. The educational requirement; level of national certificate and national certification are highly correlated with the working performance of the TVET graduates with the Pearson r of 0.7245, 0.7245, and 0.7417 respectively. Although the assessor's skills and expertise had shown low correlation but still they influence the skills, knowledge and attitude of the graduates.

Table 20. Relationship of Assessors' Profile on the Employers' Satisfaction of Graduates' Work Performance

	Pearson r	P-value	Decision	Interpretation
Assessor's Profile and Employers' satisfaction on graduates level performance	0.78	0.0535 *	Null hypothesis is rejected	The assessor's profile has very high relationship with the employers' satisfaction on graduates' level of performance.

* - significant at 5%
ns - not significant at 5%

Table 21 shows the relationship of assessors' competencies on the employers' satisfaction of graduates' level of work performance. The competencies of assessors and students were based on the different areas of qualification in Tourism Sector. Due to the similar competencies applied and practiced, the researcher has looked into the transfer of learning and skills to the students. The employers' ratings of their employees (TVET/TESDA graduates) show the correlation of the two variables.

Table 21. Relationship of Assessors' Competencies on the Employers' Satisfaction of Graduates' Level of Performance

	Pearson r	P-value	Decision	Interpretatio
--	-----------	---------	----------	---------------

				n
Assessor's Competencies and Employer's satisfaction on graduates level of performance	0.63	0.0000 *	Null hypothesis is rejected	The assessor's competencies have substantial correlation or relationship towards the employers' satisfaction on graduates' level of performance.

* - significant at 5%
ns - not significant at 5%

The data presented in table 21 revealed that the competencies of assessors were substantial or marked relationship to the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' level of performance with the Pearson r of 0.63. The level of correlation is not high as the assessor's profile because the assessors had limited encounter unlike the trainers. The trainers and students have been together for couple of months which had greatly influenced their skills, knowledge, values and development of their working attitudes. The assessor was the last person to refine the trainees' competencies and they only measure the readiness and ability of the trainee for higher level of their career path. However, the assessor had also the authority and power to correct the wrong practices of the students in their previous training. If they were strict and firm to follow the guidelines and procedure manual, they can minimize producing low quality of manpower. Being considerate is not applicable to all situations particularly if it brings iniquity to the graduates and to their future employment.

Further, the probability value obtained was 0.0000 which implied that the assessors' competencies and TVET/TESDA graduates' performance had significant relationship at 5% level of significance. The null hypothesis was rejected.

Assessors' and Students' Experiences during Assessment

The following are the characteristics created that are excerpted during interview on what the assessor experience during the conduct of assessment.

Qualifications of the assessors reflect the image of what the individual want to become. It fits the position of character that they portray. It establishes credibility and reliability to the people entrusted to them. Based on the interview, the assessors knew well about the requirements needed to become an accredited. Assessor 3 said that "they considered degree graduate, National Competency (NC) level 2 and undergone with Assessor's Methodology (AM) and Trainer's Methodology (TM), and have two years in their field of specialization. Further, Assessor 6 mentioned that "TESDA select the assessors according to qualification of the Assessors" but Assessor 1 added that "Experience and educational background is important". The educational profile and trainings attended by the assessors lead and qualify them in conducting assessment. Qualifications allow the learner to develop an increased level of independence.

The experiences of assessors in terms of age qualification show that they were not aware about the age requirement Assessor 5 explained that "age is not clear in the guidelines". However, Assessor 3 disagree; she cited that age requirement is "20 and above", she said. With regards to

gender, all of the assessors agreed that "both male and female were qualified" to be assessors.

Interviews with the students on the conduct of assessment show that readiness of the assessors as well as the candidates is important. The students knew that they are ready for the evaluation or assessment as they have successfully graduated or completed the training. As cited by Student 3 in her interview, "I can say that I am qualified for assessment because I've undergone lots of activities, quizzes and exams from the lessons that we had." Student 4 added "I am qualified for the assessment because I had a certificate from the TESDA that I've completed the training." Moreover, the assessor could submit the candidate into the assessment after the preliminary interview conducted. "If the assessor can assure that they can work on their own" as stated by Student 3, they may now proceed to the formal assessment. Further, the PTQCS Guidelines and Procedure Manual on Competency Assessment state that no candidate shall be allowed to take the competency assessment in the absence of admission slip or if no proper verification was done. However, the interview results show that the students were not aware about admission slip and verification for assessment. The need of this basic requirement was not employed and the students were not properly oriented about the guidelines.

Information drive is very important in implementing assessment. Coordinating with other agencies will help in order to make the procedure run smoothly and prevent failures. Assessments are done in the identified assessment center. The TESDA personnel communicate if a school was chosen to be the assessment center for a particular qualification. In the interview, however, the assessors experienced lack of coordination and communication. It results that there are instances when the assessors are not prepared for conducting the assessment and the assessment venue is not prepared. According to Assessor 4, "Sometimes they inform us, sometimes no time at all". However, Assessor 1 said, "they inform us through communication letter," and Assessor 5 added, "Sometimes, there is none because of so short time notice." The assessors agree that most of the time the information was delivered abruptly and the assessors have limited time to prepare.

According to Putnam (2002), objectivity involves understanding the outcome of values. The importance of objective knowledge was empirically grounded that claims free of bias, preference, desire, and other predisposing considerations. Galison (2007) cited and mention in the study of Yen and Tafarodi (2011), "objectivity" assumes ethical and moral implications. Galison claim that self-ideals were embodied with sets of "epistemic virtues" that implied both an ethics and a pragmatics of knowledge production. In this regard, it should be noted that changing across epistemic periods have been encouraged to be artistic, willful, ascetic, restrained, or dispassionately reasonable.

The assessors ensure the assessment procedure applies objectivity. The conduct of assessment becomes objective when the assessors obtain the just and fair implementation. In order to avoid biases, the assessors must know the guidelines in implementing the assessment procedure. He must know the required qualification of the assessor or candidate. He must be informed ahead of time so that he can prepare all the things needed during assessment.

Students revealed that in their experience, procedures in conducting assessment are not the same to the other assessors. For example in the duration of conducting the assessment, Student 2 experienced assessment of "one and one-half hour". Student 3 said that "there is no given time for us to finish the assessment, because each learner is unique, some are fast, and some are slow learners. It is unfair for those slow learners because they can't accomplish the task within the given time. So they give time in order to consider them". Further, Student 5 said that "Sa amin, 15 minutes preparation, 20 minutes mis-en place, etc,ug depende kung unsang klaseng assessment imo gikuha." There are assessors who strictly follow the Procedures Quality Manual and others are so relax and do not impose the proper guidelines which violated the guidelines in ensuring the objectivity and integrity of assessment.

With regards to the rating, this study revealed that there are some assessors applying favoritism and not motivating the candidate or assessor to perform the task and get the right answer. Student 3 pointed out "It depends on the assessor because some have favoritism; so to be fair, the assessor must threat the students in the same way. As assessors, they must do their responsibility and make sure they have RUBRICS in rating their students." In addition, "the basis of assessor rated me, depends on the assessors standard" said Student 4.

The interviews show that the students are seeking for objectivity in assessing them in order to have fair judgment. Being objective will erase the doubts in mind. There is confident and positive recognition to the result if the assessor is objective in his/her processes and decisions. It was found out that there are some assessors who keep the assessment tool. As cited by Assessor 6 "Assessment tool were kept by assessor". Assessor 2 added that "Usahay, TESDA will keep it". Assessor 1 agrees and said "Yes, the TESDA had a copy as well as the assessment center". With this regard, the authenticity, validity, and confidentiality are not hundred percent secured. Based on the Procedure's Quality manual, only the focal person will keep the assessment tool.

The assessor will just evaluate the candidates or students based on the evidence plan that he/she want to look for. The assessors must be objective in implementing the guidelines and procedure of assessment. Being objective must follow righteousness which indicates the fear in God. The assessors must have fear to do some actions were not upright and destroy the image of God. The bible says that people are created by image of God and our body is the temple of God. Further, data implied that the assessors must follow the correct protocol in conducting assessment particularly in securing the authenticity, validity, and confidentiality of the said assessment.

Ps 111:10 (NEB) The fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom, and they who live by it grow in understanding. The purpose of education is to enlighten the understanding, shape the character, form the habits of discipline, and prepare young men and women to fulfill their God-given potential. It takes personal responsibility for their character and learn to govern themselves under God's guidance through their conscience.

The students enumerated the problems encountered during assessment. Student 5 pointed out that "first, if the assessor

gives questions which are not valid and reliable and if it is not appropriate to the learners' qualification. Second, they miss one topic to be discussed during trainings and lastly, the learning environment is not conducive for learning." Student 2 added that "Dapat pag-naay assessment ready ang mag-assess ug mag perform labi na dapat kompleto ang mga gamit." Further, students 1, 3, and 4 agreed that assessor must give encouragement to the candidate, focus on the task and exhibit good values. The assessors must have fear in God in order that they conduct the assessment fair and just. He must be flexible and innovative on unexpected circumstances in order to pursue and appropriate assessment procedure.

On their preparation for assessment, Assessor 4 explained that "they sent letter of request" and "with that information, the assessment area is prepared a day before the assessment proper." Assessor 6 said that "the forms to be filled-up by the candidates for assessment are reproduced as well as the questionnaire for examination of theory". Further, Assessor 3 said that "Kadali lang kayo, di ko feel ang assessment sometimes". The assessors' statements show that the assessment preparation was not properly performed by the assessors due to the lack of communication from TESDA office and lack of time in preparing the chosen assessment center. The assessment must be authentic.

Even in selecting the assessment center, TESDA does not have guidelines. Assessor 3 said that "the TESDA select the venue, but sometimes the school na mag pa conduct ng assessment." Assessor 4 added that "the applicants with the consensus of the assessors select the venue." It was clearly stated in Philippine TVET Qualification and Certification System (PTQCS) Guidelines and Procedures Manual on Competency Assessment that the assessors must have full responsibility for ensuring the objectivity and integrity of assessment. As what the assessors experienced, the guideline was greatly violated.

Authentic assessment is any type of assessment that requires students to demonstrate skills and competencies that realistically represent problems and situations likely to be encountered in daily life. Students are required to produce ideas, to integrate knowledge, and to complete tasks that have real-world applications. Such approaches require the person making the assessment to use human judgment in the application of criterion-referenced standards.

The data cited implied that the assessors must be authentic in his action. Students are assessed according to specific criteria that are known to them in advance. The basic idea is that students are more likely to be interested in what they are learning, more motivated to learn new concepts and skills, and better prepared to succeed in college, careers, and adulthood if what they are learning mirrors real-life contexts, equips them with practical and useful skills, and addresses topics that are relevant and applicable to their lives outside of school.

The researcher gathered information regarding the number of candidates per assessment. The researcher found out that number of candidates was beyond the capacity of the assessor per assessment. According to Assessor 6, "students are actually beyond the maximum number of candidate or students in a day". Assessor 3 experienced "fifteen (15) assess per assessor per day". The chairperson of FST Department said that there were times that assessment procedures turn into disappointment. In her interview, she

cited that most of the time, the number of the candidates assessed were more than the standard number which leads unsystematic assessment.

It is stated in the Procedures Quality Manual that there should be 10 candidates per assessor but this guideline are not followed. The number of students per assessor is not consistent. Therefore, the quality in giving assessment is not sufficient especially if the assessors are tired assessing more than the number set in the standard. In connection to the results presented, the assessors sometimes cannot give much time to the candidate or assess and cannot perform the prescribed values explicitly. But, more or less the assessors tried to perform the best that they could.

The assessors must show the proper procedure and follow the guideline. They must be authoritative in making decisions particularly in implementing the guidelines of assessment. According to State of New South Wales, Department of Education and Training (2009) stated that values can influence many of the judgments we make as well as have an impact on the support we give clients. It is important that we do not influence client's decisions based on our values. We should always work from the basis of supporting the client's values.

Furthermore, student understanding of the assessment process is facilitated by clear explanations of the assessment tasks, how the assessment tasks relate to the learning outcomes, and the criteria and standards against which students will be assessed (Harlen, W., 2005). Furthermore, clear criteria and achievement standards for the assessment of student work are made available to students, with the task descriptions at the beginning of the semester.

In terms of ensuring the authenticity, validity, and confidentiality of all documents entrusted to the assessor, they said that they "keep it 100% sure!" as mentioned by Assessor 3. Further, Assessor 6 said that personally "I do keep the records/ result of assessment for confidentiality. We usually prepare rubrics for an actual assessment of skills for the authenticity and validity of the assessment". Moreover, "the focal person or CAC Manager keeps the documents" said Assessor 1. It implied that the assessors must have the value of stability which they show strength on imposing the constancy of the assessment procedure.

Dictionary defined stability as the state of being resistant to change and not prone to wild fluctuations in emotion. High performance in the workplace emanates from self-actualization. This is because the people are more committed, more initiative, boarder and deeper sense of responsibility, and learn faster. The more people who practice the higher virtues in life, the more stable the practice will be. On the other hand, active values direct the choices and therefore evident in day-to-day life.

With regards to the conduct of assessment and tools used, the researcher found out that they had different evidence tool used in very qualification. For example in Food and Beverage Services, Assessor 6 said that "we conduct it by giving the written exam as the first step to measure the knowledge and skills. Next, we do have the actual and oral assessment on fine dining, service activity and finally the Room service assessment. We have questionnaires for written exam and rubrics for the actual". "When we conduct assessment in Commercial Cooking, we give an instruction on what they will perform and while doing their work we conduct oral questioning. We do have criteria for judging

their output" said by Assessor 5. Assessor 4 added that "we do interview and conduct actual performance, but if the candidates are with experience, we do portfolio as long he/she can show us 5 valid certificates."

Therefore, giving rating to the candidates depends on the assessor standards. There is really a need to have assessors' moderation in conducting assessment so that standard will be practiced and implemented by every assessor internationally. It's up to the assessor's discretion. "But if you are the assessor you know the competencies that you want to measure as well as the standard" said Assessor 1. In this fact, the TESDA vision and goal are still materialized.

A flexible person is able to exercise maximum tolerance when necessary and to work within the "spirit of majority rule" to preserve workplace cohesiveness (Archimedes Articulo, 2003). Individual begin to realize that good and bad habits are formed through their actions. However, proficiency requires holistic growth and continuous learning. Learning would not mean acquiring more information but expanding the ability to produce better results for life.

Further, the assessors' proficiency contributes human development (candidate) and fulfillment by providing a means for personal expression and future experiences in the workplace of the TVET graduates. The assessors must be equipped with the proper skills, positive attitude towards work and values that lead to work effectiveness and productivity. Assessors' flexibility makes him also easily adjust and adapt the working environment.

In the question regarding uniformity in the conduct of assessment, Assessor 4 said "No uniformity given. Some have their own guidelines and it differs from each assessment center." Assessor 1 also said that "they don't have uniform in conducting the assessment, sometimes the assessors don't follow the criteria given". "Usually, assessors' differ their assessment from their judgment of a candidate's skills. Another is through their knowledge in standards or the skill" said Assessor 6. Furthermore, Assessor 3 described her experience that "sometimes there is uniformity, but most of the time not! Because during actual kailangan mag-roam around and ask questions to the candidate about what they are doing and check if they used the proper tools after the activities, there is a one on one interview, but some assessors didn't do that. Lalo na pagkilala, recommended by (paused and smile), pasadayon kahit di alam ang qualification." The statement revealed that the assessors have differences in conducting the assessment. It implied that some assessors were subjective with their rating. They deviate to follow the objectivity manner in assessing. The idea is tested in reality and modified to meet unforeseen needs and challenges which innovation takes place. If there was failure happened in the previous assessment procedure, the assessors were challenged to innovate new practices that could give better result and improve the traditional way of conducting assessment.

However in giving the results, it seems they have the same procedure. Assessors do one on one discussion and explain the candidate their weak points and give the CARS right away. Sometimes "when I mentioned their mistakes, I immediately give the right answer and sometimes I'm giving short lecture to them so that they won't commit mistakes again if they do re-assessment" said Assessor 6. Assessor 3 narrated that she gave feed backing first, then the result. "The assess na pumasa happy and feel their

accomplishment. But those did not pass, they feel sad, and always asking what they going to do and how they can get NC2?"

The differences in assessment lead into imperfection. Even the TESDA conducts assessor's moderation as what they planned the assurance on having smooth and standard procedure in conducting assessment will never be achieved if the TESDA would not look into the basic requirements of TESDA assessors. The success of assessment depends on the control of assessor. Further, Assessor 3 said that "If all assessors have forum and set one rule or policy na sundon sa tanang assessor lalo na sa the way of assessment." Assessor 4 pointed out that "If bagsak s'ya, bagsak jud!" The assessors must show stability in his/her decision and innovative in facing the problem raised during assessment. Assessor 3 pointed out that "Dapat magka-isa tanan assessor!" "Kaya nga merong assessment moderation last time to solve the problem in assessment procedure. We must hope na masunod na 'yong ating ginawa" said by Assessor 4. In order to have assurance that the assessment procedure were followed the standard, the assessor must rate the students according to their performance based on the assessment tools and guidelines. Assessor 5 agreed that rating the assess depends upon their performance whether they pass or not according to the guidelines per qualification.

Innovation can be viewed as the application of better solutions that meet new requirements, inarticulate needs, or existing market needs. Common causes of failure within the innovation process in most organizations can be distilled into poor goal definition, poor alignment of actions to goals, poor participation in teams, poor monitoring of results, poor communication and access to information. To be truly innovative, it must produce lasting benefits which meet the needs of the many, not just the few.

The assessors' experiences during assessment had positive and negative outlook in implementation of assessment procedure. Assessor 6 experienced discouraging scenario, she said that "I really disappointed with the system of assessment because one time I conducted assessment were 7 of them got failed. I give them a rating of not yet competent but in the following days I was surprised that the CAC Manager calls my attention about the assessment and request me to pass the 7 candidates that I failed. I made some arguments with the CAC Manger but he told me that the President of that particular school called the TESDA Focal Person asking for reconsideration and let their students pass the assessment. I was dismay with the system but I told the CAC Manager, "let other assessor do the re-assessment and pass them." It is so disappointing! Addition, assessor 1 stated that she meet some case like the candidates had lack of training and there are some assessor that had no experience or no exposure in actual work in hospitality industry. However, Assessor 4 said that "not all the time, we encountered bad experience like sometimes we are satisfied with the passing result of the candidates and in contrast we are also afraid to the other applicant that cannot comply with the passing rate." As what assessor 6 experienced that she was treated like a VIP (Very Important Person) when she was invited to conduct assessment in other assessment center.

The feeling of closeness and friendship that exists between companions which lead to have a common aims. Aristotle point of view that it is better to give than to receive

in friendship. He also believed that friendship can only arise indirectly, like happiness. It comes with living what he called a good life, including strong personal values such as honesty, character and passion. Vernon (2006) supports the idea of Aristotle and wrote that *“a close friend is a mirror of your own self, someone with whom you realize that, though autonomous, you are not alone.”* He adds that friendship is also important in politics because it *“cultivates the virtues, such as creativity and compassion, which are essential to a flourishing society”*.

Even that the experiences of assessors were differ from each other, it gives link to each other. Co-assessor can also help alleviate the work-related stress. Even though they may be stretched to the limit time-wise, the investment for friendships will be worth the psychological benefits. Friends are better at describing our behavioral traits than we are. Comradeship doesn't take much skill to cultivate close and fascinating type of human bond, but it does take some effort to pay off in helping them lead more fulfilling life.

During the interview of the students about how the assessors handle the problems that arise during assessment. The students had positively answered that they handle it calmly and *“He handles it by choosing a strategy that is appropriate to the level and capacity of the learners”* said by Student 3.

The students or candidate felt intimidating to the assessors and sometimes to the assessment center or venue. The things that affect student's performance, *“if the assessor will not motivate and encourage the learners to participate in an activity, also if the assessor didn't praise their answer and decline their opinions”* said Student 3. Further, *“nervous”* said by Student 5 and *“Audience! Labing mga taong a sige bang himantay labi na sa mga mali”* added by Student 2.

It implied that the assessment experienced by the students is empirically different from each other. They stresses out that the assessment was depend upon how the assessors interpret the guideline and administer it. Furthermore, the selection of assessment center was not conducive to the candidate who was clearly stated in PTQCS Guidelines and Procedure Manual on Competency Assessment that conducting the assessment shall be strictly within the premises of the assessment center or designated assessment venue. The assessors must be proficient in his/her field of discipline with authoritative manner. Addition, he must show comradeship not only to his/her co-assessor but also to the candidates.

Whatever candidates are “taught” about good assessment practice can be undermined by poor assessment practice in teacher preparation; thus, modeling the best of what is known about effective use of assessment is a critical aspect of teacher preparation, not just in coursework, but also in exposure to student work and all of the field and clinical experiences of candidates. Teachers will assess students' understanding frequently in the classroom to provide them with feedback and determine next steps for instruction. Their classroom practices will be grounded in principles of how students think and learn in content domains and of assessment as a process of reasoning from evidence. Teachers will use this knowledge to design assessments that provide students with feedback about particular qualities of their work and what they can do to improve (Emerson J. Elliott, April 29, 2010).

Further, the students narrate their experiences during assessment which presented the problem encountered. Student 5 enumerated her problem encountered during assessment first, she experienced that *“the assessor gives questions which are not valid and reliable and if it is not appropriate to the learners because it is away from the qualification taken. Second, they miss one topic to be discussed during trainings, and lastly, the learning environment is not conducive for learning.”* Assessor 1 suggested that assessor must give presence of mind and concentration to the task. Furthermore, *“dapat pag-naay assessment ready ang mag-assess ug nag mag performed labi na dapat kompleto ang mga gamit”* said by student 2. However, other students experienced lack of time, mental block, damage of utensils and misunderstanding with the assessor.

Educational experiences presumably promote the intellectual openness, flexibility, and breadth perspective essential for self-direction values (Kohn & Schooler 1983). Basak Ucanok (2009) cited that according to Zedeck work values defines as goals that people strive to attain through working. Work values or work orientations are more general and abstract than work goals or satisfaction, and they reflect an employee's general preferences toward not only their current job but also potential future jobs (Malika & Chatman, 2003; Vansteenkiste et al., 2007). A value is a principal or standard that is held in high esteem by an individual and is related to all aspects of one's personal and work life.

IV. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary of Findings

Based on results of the study, the following are the findings:

- 1.six (6) assessors were rated as very much qualified in terms of educational requirement, and national certification. In terms of assessor's level of national certificate, and skills and expertise, they are rated as highly qualified.
- 2.the assessors in the implementation of areas of Qualification Assessment and Competency Based Assessment (CBC) were rated as very much competent both assessors and students.
- 3.the employers are satisfied on the different qualification of the TVET graduates.
- 4.the assessors' profile had high correlation or very high relationship towards the employers' satisfaction on graduate's level performance. Thus, null hypothesis was rejected at 0.05 level of significance. Further, the competencies of assessors were substantial or marked relationship to the employers' satisfaction on TVET/TESDA graduates' level of performance. The null hypothesis was rejected at 0.05% level of significance.
- 5.the assessors knew well about the requirements needed for becoming an accredited assessor. However, there are technical procedures that are not disseminated correctly to all assessors which lead for the diversity in interpretation and implementation of procedures. As experienced by the students revealed that procedures in conducting assessment are not the same to the other assessors. There are assessors that strictly follows the Procedures Quality

Manual and others are so relax and did not imposed the proper guidelines.

6. there were nine (9) model characteristics developed for the Tourism Sector assessors such as Objective, Qualified, Stability, Authoritative, Authentic, Proficient, Innovative, Comradeship, and Flexible.

Conclusion

On the bases of the findings of the study, the following conclusions were drawn:

The employers of TVET graduates were satisfied on the working performance. The employers were confident to leave the work and trusted it to the TVET graduates because they can perform the work with less supervision. Further, the employers require the TVET graduates to undergo deep training for some competencies. Therefore, the researcher also concluded that there are some aspects the TVET graduates are good and some needs improvement.

The Tourism Sector assessors' profile had very high relationship to the working performance of TVET graduates. However, the assessors' competences were concluded as average contributory in the development because it marks only with substantial correlation. Thus, these characteristics were necessary to the students' development but it needs a longer time for them to acquire.

The results of the study finally concluded that the Tourism Sector Assessors should possess the characteristics such as Objective, Qualified, Stability, Authoritative, Authentic, Proficient, Innovative, Comradeship, and Flexible that could contribute the positive attributes of TVET graduates' performance.

Recommendation

The researcher recommends that TESDA and TVET institution will look into the possibility of creating a body that will review the Quality Manual procedure compliance of the assessors and create a development program for assessors. There is also a need to improve the implementation of assessment procedure and selection of assessor.

Furthermore, the TESDA officials may conduct intensive monitoring and evaluation to the profile of assessor and implementation of assessment procedure. They may formulate checklist questionnaire to evaluate the manners and actuation of assessors during assessment. With this purpose, we may give rewards to the identified model assessor that delivers his/her task efficiently for three consecutive years and lead for the employment of great workers to the different agencies/industries. Moreover, TESDA will create and provide list of accredited assessor and assessment center for the employer preference in his job acquisition.

REFERENCES

- [1] 2008 impact evaluation study of TVET programs. (2010, April). Policy research and evaluation.
- [2] 2009 survey of tourism establishments in the philippines (STEP) for accommodation: Final results. (2012, January 13). Retrieved from <http://census.gov.ph/content/2009-survey-tourism-establishments-philippines-step-accommodation-final-results>
- [3] Andal, R. (2012, November 27). TVET graduates ng TESDA paborito ng mga employer. *Pilipino star ngayon*. Retrieved from <http://www.philstar.com/bansa/2012/11/27/874329/tvet-graduates-ng-tesda-paborito-ng-mga-employer>
- [4] Anonymous. (2005). VSS consultants. Retrieved from <http://www.vssconsultants.com/asst.html>.
- [5] Anonymous. (2011). TESDA. Retrieved from <http://www.tesda7.org/about/and> <http://en.wikipedia.org>
- [6] Assessment performance. (2011, November 7). Retrieved from <http://www.tesda.gov.ph/pdf>
- [7] Beardsley, A. (n.d.). Teacher research informing policy: An analysis of research on highly qualified teaching and NCLB. Arizona State University.
- [8] Berry, B. (2003). What it means to be "highly qualified teacher". Southeast Center for Teaching Quality.
- [9] Biggs, J. (2002). *Aligning teaching and assessment to curriculum objectives*. LTSN Generic Centre.
- [10] Boud, D. (1991). *Implementing student assessment*. Higher Education Research and Development of Association of Australia, Sydney.
- [11] Brown, G. (2001). *Assessment: A guide for lecturers*. LTSN Generic Centre, Assessment Series No.3.
- [12] Brown, J. C. (1989). Situated Cognition and the culture of Learning. *Educational Research*, Vol. 18 (1). 32-42.
- [13] Calderon, J. (2013, March 5). Philippine tourism to create 3.6m jobs. Retrieved from <http://investvine.com/philippine-tourism-aims-to-create-3-6m-jobs/>
- [14] Chaturvedi, M. (2010). Development of emotional stability scale. *Industrial Psychiatry Journal*.
- [15] Cheong, W. M. (n.d.). Employment characteristics and trends of Tourism-related industries. Macao: Research and Statistics Department Monetary Authority.
- [16] Clewley, L. B. (n.d.). So what does "being qualified" really mean? A critical perspective on a growing trend of "credentialism" and its relevance in work places in 21st century. New Zealand: Competency International Ltd.
- [17] Concept of job satisfaction. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://epress.lib.uts.edu.pdf>
- [18] Contribution of tourism industry to economy posts 5.9 percent in 2011. (2012, January 13). National Statistical Coordination board.
- [19] Contribution of tourism industry to the economy post 5.9 percent in 2011. (2012, November 26). Retrieved from http://www.nscb.gov.ph/pressreleases/2012/PR-20121126_ES4-01_PTSA.asp#VkfzpzZb09
- [20] Contribution of tourism industry to the economy posts 5.9 percent in 2011. (2013, September 27). National Statistical Coordination Board.
- [21] Cote, S. (1999). Affect of performance in organizational settings. *American Psychological Society*, vol. 8(2), 65-68.
- [22] Declaration of policy. (1995). *Republic Act No. 7796: Technical education and skills development act of 1994 (with implementing rules and regulation)*.
- [23] Educational assessment. (2013, January 25). Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Educational_assessment
- [24] Education in the Philippines. (2010). Retrieved from <http://en.wikipedia.org>
- [25] Employers satisfied with performance of TESDA graduates. (2012, November 27). *Positive news media*. Retrieved from <http://positivenewsmedia.com/blog/2012/11/employers-satisfied-with-performance-of-tesda-graduates/>
- [26] ERNWACA. (2013, December). *NTA Tracer Study Of Technical*.
- [27] Evaluation and assessment module. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://olms1.cite.jhu.edu/olms/output/pagesite.php?pageID=680&siteID=222>
- [28] Experiential learning. (2010). Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Experiential_learning
- [29] Fisher, C. (2003). Why do lay people believe that satisfaction and performance are correlated? Possible source of a commonsense theory. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, Vol. 24, 753-777.
- [30] Furger, R. (2002, January 21). Retrieved from <http://www.edutopia.org/assessment-for-understanding-taking-deeper-look>
- [31] General guidelines on the implementation of assessment and certification program under the Philippine TVET qualification and certification system (PTQCS). (2006). *TESDA Circular No.21 s. 2006*.
- [32] Gilmore, A. &. (2008, September 5). Students' experience of assessment.

- [33] Given, I. M. (2008). *The sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*. Calif, Los Angeles: Sage Publication.
- [34] Greetz, C. (1983). *Local knowledge*. New York: Basic Books.
- [35] Hammond, L. a. (2010). *Benchmarking learning system: Student performance assessment in international context*. Standford, CA: Standford University, Standford Center for Opportunity Policy in Education.
- [36] Hayakawa, S. &. (1976). *Language in thought and action*. New York: HBJ.
- [37] Hernandez, M. (2010, April). 2008 Impact evaluation study of TVET programs. Policy research and evaluation division (Planing office).
- [38] How to improve job satisfaction and increase employee. (March, 2012). *RSI Employers Source Journal e-Newsletter*. Retrieved from <http://www.rsiemployerssource.com>
- [39] Identification: psychology. (2012, December 7). Retrieved from [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/identification_\(psychodynamic\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/identification_(psychodynamic))
- [40] Indicators, I.-A. W. (2012, April). Proposed indicators for assessing technical and vocational education and training. ETF, ILO, UNESCO.
- [41] Jensen, J. (2001). *Improving training in order to upgrade skills in Tourism sector*. Europe: Tourism and Employment.
- [42] Job performance. (2012, October 19). Retrieved from <http://en.wikipedia.org>
- [43] Job satisfaction. (2012, November 30). Retrieved from <http://en.wikipedia.org>
- [44] Kazan, C. (2010, January 7). With record low employee satisfaction, employers need to think out of the box to boost morale. Retrieved from <http://www.employerofchoice.com>
- [45] Knoell, C. M. (2012, May). The role of the student-teacher relationship in the lives of fifth graders: A mixed methods analysis. *A disertation*. Lincoln, Nebraska.
- [46] Kulm, G. (1991). *Science assessment in the service of reform*. Washington, DC.: American Association for the Advancement of Science.
- [47] Lorenzo, G. a. (October 2005). *DEmonstrating and assessing student learning with e-portfolios*. EDUCAUSE Learning Initiative.
- [48] Mayhew, R. (2013). What are ways to increase job satisfaction? Retrieved from <http://www.ehow.com/info>
- [49] Miller, m. (2006, August). Assessment: A literature review. Dalkeith, Midlothian: Scottish Qualifications Authority.
- [50] Model:profession. (2013, January 25). Retrieved from [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Model\(profession\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Model(profession))
- [51] Murcia, A. (2012, July 25). Employers prefer TESDA grads. *ABS-CBN store*. Retrieved from <http://www.journal.com.ph/index.php/new/national/34677-employers-prefer-tesda-grads>
- [52] O'Farrel, C. (n.d.). Enhancing student learning through assessment: A toolkit approach. Dublin Institute of Technology.
- [53] Organization, I. L. (2010, November 23-24). Development and challenges in the hospitality and tourism sector. Geneva: Global Dialogue Forum for the Hotels, Ctaering, Tourism Sector.
- [54] Poor performance. (2012). Retrieved from <http://www.cma.org.pfd>
- [55] Putnam, H. (2002). *The collapse of the fact/value dichotomy and other essays*. Cambridge MA:Harvard University Press.
- [56] Race, P. (2001). *A briefing on self, peer and group assessment*. LTSN Generic Centre, Assessment Series 9.
- [57] Richardson, R. B. (2010, June). The Contribution of Tourism to Economic Growth and Food Security. USAID Mali, Office of Economic Growth.
- [58] Role engulfment. (2012, May 11). Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Role_engulfment
- [59] Role model. (2008, April 23). Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Role_model
- [60] Sabit, N. C. (2008). *Perceptions of Vocational Heads and Instructors on competency-based curriculum of tertiary schools in the province of North Cotabato*. Kidapawan City: Central Mindanao College.
- [61] Shah, M. (2011). Employer satisfaction of university graduates: key capabilities in early career graduates. Retrieved from <http://academia.edu>
- [62] Shavelson R.J., B. G. (1991). *Performance assessment in science*. Applied Measurement in Education.
- [63] Slater, T. F. (1993). *Perfomance Assessment*. Department of Physics Montana State University.
- [64] Social learning theory. (2010). Retrieved from <http://www.Learningtheories.com/vygotsky-social-learning-theory.html>
- [65] Sundberg, M. (2002). assessing student learning. Retrieved from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pn/articles/PMC118374>
- [66] Technical education and skills development authority. (2006). *Ladderized education program*.
- [67] Technical education and skills development authority. (2006). *TVET outlook*.
- [68] Terry, R. E. (2002). Definition of student competencies and development of an educational plan to assess student mastery level. *Vol. 18 (2)*, 225-235. Provo, USA, Utah: Tempus Publication.
- [69] TESDA Circular No. 14 s 2005. (2005). *Guidelines in the implementation of the Philippine TVET qualification and certification system*.
- [70] TESDA programs and services. (2011). Retrieved from <http://www.tesda7.org/programs-and-services/>
- [71] The Philippine tourism industry. (2014, April). 23. Congressional Policy and Budget Research Department and Budget Research Department.
- [72] Thompson, S. G. (n.d.). Highly qualified for successful teaching: Characteristics every teacher should possess. University of Memphis.
- [73] Trainers methodology. (2010). Retrieved from <http://TMTP-TRAINERS-METHODOLOGY-TRAINING-PROGRAM-OF-TESDA-PART1>
- [74] Tripney, J. E. (2013, February 09). post-basic technical and vocational education and training (TVET) interventions to improve employability and employment of TVET graduates in low-and middle-income countries: a systematic review.
- [75] Ugbe, A. U. (2009). Influence of teachers' competence n students academic performance in senior secondary school chemistry. *Global Journal of Eduactaional Research*, 8 (1-2).
- [76] Usman, E. K. (2012, Jul 22). Employers satisfied with TESda graduates. Retrieved from <http://www.mb.com.ph/articles/366965/employers-satisfie-withtesda-graduates>
- [77] Value formation and education. (n.d.). Retrieved from hp://www.icpd.org/education/value_formation_and_education.htm
- [78] Vernon, M. (2006, November). *The philosophy of friendship*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- [79] Wahba, M. (n.d.). *Competence standards for technical and vocational education and training TVET*. Retrieved from CompetenceStandardforTVET.pdf.
- [80] Wayne, A. (2003). Teacher characteristics and student achievement gains: A review. *Review of Eduactional Research*, 73 (1), 89-122.
- [81] What is employee satisfaction. (2013). Retrieved from <http://www.wisegeek.org/what-is-employee-satisfaction.htm>.
- [82] Work Group for Health Development. (2014). Qualitative methods to assess community. Retrieved from <http://ctb.ku.edu/en.table-of-contents/assessment/assessing-community-needs-and-resources/qualitative-methods/main>
- [83] Work satisfaction and work performance. (2011). Retrieved from <http://eprints.usm.pdf>
- [84] Yen, J. (2011). Becoming scientific:objectivity, identity, and relevance as experienced by grdaute students in psychology. *Forum Qualitative Sozialization/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 12 (2), Art.26. Retrieved from <http://nbn-resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:011fq51102260>



DR EMILIE SUAREZ-ESTELOSO is a graduate of Bachelor of Science in Industrial Education major in Food Trades in 2004 as Cum Laude. In year 2007, she finished her Master of Arts in Education major in Educational Management and year 2016, she graduated her Doctor of Philosophy in Education at Notre Dame of Dadianggas University. She is the Program Head of

Bachelor of Technical Vocational Teacher Education since 2016-2022 and currently she is the Department Head of Technology Education Department. She's been teaching in the University of Southern Mindanao - Kidapawan City Campus for 17 years. She's married to Mr. Jezreel C. Esteloso and blessed with two children. .